



OPEN ACCESS

EDITED AND REVIEWED BY
Manuela Lemos Vaz-Velho,
Polytechnic Institute of Viana do
Castelo, Portugal

*CORRESPONDENCE
Janice Alano Ragaza
✉ jragaza@ateneo.edu;
✉ janice_a_ragaza@yahoo.com

RECEIVED 10 July 2023
ACCEPTED 07 August 2023
PUBLISHED 15 August 2023

CITATION
Ragaza JA, Kumar V and Traifalgar RFM (2023)
Editorial: Innovative, non-conventional
ingredients for sustainable aquafeeds.
Front. Sustain. Food Syst. 7:1256460.
doi: 10.3389/fsufs.2023.1256460

COPYRIGHT
© 2023 Ragaza, Kumar and Traifalgar. This is an
open-access article distributed under the terms
of the [Creative Commons Attribution License
\(CC BY\)](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). The use, distribution or reproduction
in other forums is permitted, provided the
original author(s) and the copyright owner(s)
are credited and that the original publication in
this journal is cited, in accordance with
accepted academic practice. No use,
distribution or reproduction is permitted which
does not comply with these terms.

Editorial: Innovative, non-conventional ingredients for sustainable aquafeeds

Janice Alano Ragaza^{1*}, Vikas Kumar² and
Rex Ferdinand M. Traifalgar³

¹Ateneo Aquatic and Fisheries Resources Laboratory, Department of Biology, School of Science and Engineering, Ateneo de Manila University, Quezon City, Philippines, ²Department of Animal, Veterinary and Food Sciences, College of Agricultural and Life Science, University of Idaho, Moscow, ID, United States, ³Institute of Aquaculture, College of Fisheries and Ocean Sciences, University of the Philippines Visayas, Miagao, Iloilo, Philippines

KEYWORDS

alternative aquafeeds, sustainable aquaculture, systematic review and meta-analysis, copra meal, pea meal, squid industry by-product hydrolysates, marine diatoms

Editorial on the Research Topic

Innovative, non-conventional ingredients for sustainable aquafeeds

Most countries and regions of the world have single-handedly or jointly engaged in efforts to achieve the 17 United Nations Sustainable Development Goals (UN SDG) by the year 2030. Currently, aquaculture already feeds billions of people and will continue to do so, hence, addressing the problems of global food security and nutritional health, poverty alleviation, and even economic growth. Nevertheless, the advantages gained from aquaculture must not be offset by the negative environmental and social consequences that it may impart. As one of the fastest growing food-producing industries in the world, aquaculture must assure sustainable, long-term efforts, practices, and actions to heed the global call to meet the UN SDG.

A major component in sustainable aquaculture is fish feed development and discovery of novel feed ingredients. As more than half of the cost in aquaculture production comes from feeds, different feed reduction schemes have been employed and adopted. One of the more promising approaches is the adoption of circular bioeconomy in aquafeed use and development. Circular bioeconomy in aquaculture is achieved through the use, reuse, and/or recycling of non-conventional but modern, innovative fish feed ingredients such as by-products, agricultural industry processing wastes, and natural raw materials that do not compete with human food consumption. These revalorized feed ingredients are often cost-effective, environmentally sustainable, and pose no serious negative effects on the environment. Before utilizing novel feed ingredients, they undergo rigorous testing and evaluation. Two ways are generally employed to evaluate the feasibility and potential of candidate feed ingredients—via systematic review and meta-analysis and through *in vivo* testing. Each method has its own advantages and caveats.

Systematic review and meta-analysis are standard tools in the field of medicine that aim to provide a more accurate picture of the effects of different medical treatments (Egger et al., 2001; Impellizzeri and Bizzini, 2012). More recently, however, numerous studies using systematic review and meta-analysis of various feed ingredients and effects thereof on fish performance and overall health have been published (Bertocci and Mannino, 2022; Li et al., 2022; Mugwanya et al., 2022; Tran et al., 2022; Moyo and Rapatsa-Malatji, 2023; Trevi et al., 2023). The use of systematic review and meta-analysis in aquaculture can provide a precise estimate of the consistent effects of feed ingredients on fish performance across various culture species. A major caveat of these tools, however, is the inherent heterogeneity of the data systematically collected, screened and reviewed.

Factors such as the type of cultured species, feed formulations and preparations, culture conditions, and other external or environmental influences differ among the data. These factors introduce variability across studies making it difficult to achieve an unbiased and accurate combination and comparison of results. Nonetheless, this tool can still be exploited as an initial filter for screening potential and candidate fish feed ingredients, especially when coupled with *in vivo* testing. A confirmatory evaluation of the results from the systematic review and meta-analysis through *in vivo* testing may resolve the issues of potential biases, differences, skewed data, and/or confounding factors.

In the Research Topic, [Magbanua and Ragaza\(a\)](#) subjected the effects of copra meal on growth and carcass composition of Nile tilapia as a dietary fishmeal replacement to systematic review and meta-analysis. Copra meal is a by-product of the coconut processing industry. It is treated as a waste product of the extraction of coconut oil from the dried coconut meat. When fermented, copra meal in various inclusion levels ([Laining et al., 2017](#); [Mamaug et al., 2019](#); [Harlina et al., 2021](#); [Intoy and Traifalgar, 2021](#)) showed promising results as an aquafeed for several fish species. In [Magbanua and Ragaza\(a\)](#), however, a lower dietary crude protein in copra meal-based diets translates to enhanced tilapia growth. Due to the relatively lower nutritional values of copra meal, such as an imbalanced amino acid profile, low protein content, poor digestibility, and high fiber, it remains subpar to fishmeal. The values of the tilapia proximate composition, however, were comparable and on par with those fed fishmeal-based diets. The co-variables (i.e., dietary levels of fishmeal and copra meal, length of feeding, developmental stage of the cultured fish, and dietary protein content) selected did not cause the heterogeneity. Other untested factors such as the method of feed and ingredient preparation (especially the fermentation of copra) and the inherent nutritional properties of the copra meal may have attributed to the variability in the data.

In another meta-analysis by [Magbanua and Ragaza\(b\)](#), the use of dietary pea meal for Nile tilapia are affected by factors such as the length of the feeding, developmental stage of the cultured fish, and dietary protein content. These factors should be critically considered to maximize the potential of pea meal as a fishmeal replacement. For example, diets with pea meal that are characterized by high crude protein contents may lead to growth reduction of fish. On the other hand, a longer period may promote better fish performance. Although peas contain adequate quantities of protein and essential amino acids ([Millar et al., 2019](#)), they possess anti-nutritional factors such as saponins, tannins, phytic acid, lectin and trypsin inhibitors ([Ganzon-Naret, 2018](#); [Wu et al., 2023](#)) that directly affect the quality of proteins, the availability of amino acids, and overall nutrient absorption. Hence, processing and quality control measures (e.g., dehulling, autoclaving, and heating) are crucial steps to reduce the effects of anti-nutritional factors.

In vivo testing involves the practical and realistic evaluation of potential fish feed ingredients. Target cultured species can be selected which allows for an optimized feed formulation and feeding regimen for the chosen fish species. Other than measuring growth, feed and health performance, this tool can also provide information on the optimum levels or ranges for specific feed

ingredients. These levels and ranges can then be used for strategies to reduce feed costs.

Squid by-product meals are considered as high quality protein sources and feed stimulants for many aquatic species ([Samaddar, 2018](#)). Squid by-products include squid parts that are rendered as wastes or unfit for human use and consumption such as the head, tentacles, fins, viscera, skin, pen, and mantle ([Ezquerria-Brauer and Aubourg, 2019](#); [Ramakrishnan et al., 2023](#)). In [Pan et al.](#), squid industry processing wastes were enzymatically hydrolyzed and supplemented in diets for black tiger shrimp. Hydrolysis increased the crude protein content of the ingredient by 10% while the chemical score indices of most of the essential amino acids were close to or more than 100%. The hydrolysates were also composed of low-molecular weight peptides. The growth performance of shrimp fed with 1% squid hydrolysates in a plant-based diet was found comparable to the group fed with fishmeal based diets. These findings could increase the utility of squid processing industry by-products and wastes and could lower the use of fishmeal in shrimp diets.

Long-chain, highly unsaturated fatty acids are abundant in marine microalgae and diatoms ([Yi et al., 2017](#)). These bioactive fatty acids are almost non-existent in terrestrial sources such as plant oils. In [Huervana et al.](#), the marine diatom *Thalassiosira weissflogii* was used for the diets of seawater-tolerant Nile tilapia for improvement of the fish fatty acid profile. Due to the high levels of omega-3 or n-3 fatty acids in the marine diatom, the tilapia exhibited improved n-3 fatty acid profile, n-3 long-chain, polyunsaturated fatty acids, and n-3:n-6 ratios. Moreover, genes related to growth in the muscle were upregulated. An optimum dose of 2.55% *T. weissflogii* improved tilapia growth. Findings of this work suggest that cultured marine diatom could be successfully used as a source of omega-3 or n-3 fatty acids for the diet of saline tilapia. This could decrease the reliance of aquaculture on the use of fish oil as an important ingredient for fish diets. Marine diatoms could be a sustainable and renewable resource of important fatty acids for fish diets.

Author contributions

JR: Conceptualization, Project administration, Supervision, Writing—original draft, Writing—review and editing. VK: Writing—review and editing, Project administration. RT: Project administration, Validation, Writing—review and editing.

Acknowledgments

The guest editors are sincerely thankful to the author contributors and the invited reviewers involved in the Research Topic.

Conflict of interest

The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

Publisher's note

All claims expressed in this article are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of their affiliated

organizations, or those of the publisher, the editors and the reviewers. Any product that may be evaluated in this article, or claim that may be made by its manufacturer, is not guaranteed or endorsed by the publisher.

References

- Bertocci, F., and Mannino, G. (2022). Can agri-food waste be a sustainable alternative in aquaculture? A bibliometric and meta-analytic study on growth performance, innate immune system, and antioxidant defenses. *Foods* 11, 1861. doi: 10.3390/foods11131861
- Egger, M., Smith, G. D., and Altman, D. (2001). *Systematic Reviews in Health Care: Meta-Analysis in Context, 2nd Edn.* London: BMJ Books.
- Ezquerro-Brauer, J. M., and Aubourg, S. P. (2019). Recent trends for the employment of jumbo squid (*Dosidicus gigas*) by-products as a source of bioactive compounds with nutritional, functional and preservative applications: a review. *Int. J. Food Sci. Technol.* 54, 987–998. doi: 10.1111/ijfs.14067
- Ganzon-Naret, E. S. (2018). Evaluation of different processing methods on the nutritional composition and certain anti-nutritional factors in peas *Pisum sativum*. *ABAH Bioflux* 10, 18–26.
- Harlina, H., Hamdillah, A., Kamaruddin, K., and Aslamyah, S. (2021). "Digestibility of fermented copra meal for fish as plant protein source in the Saline tilapia (*Oreochromis niloticus*) seeds," in *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science (Vol. 763, No. 1)*. (Bristol: IOP Publishing), e012033. doi: 10.1088/1755-1315/763/1/012033
- Impellizzeri, F. M., and Bizzini, M. (2012). Systematic review and meta-analysis: a primer. *Int. J. Sport Phys. Ther.* 7, 493–503.
- Intoy, M. M. B., and Traifalgar, R. F. M. (2021). Feed value of fermented copra meal as a sustainable feed ingredient in the diet of saline-tolerant Nile tilapia *Oreochromis niloticus* (Linnaeus 1758). *J. Sustainabil. Sci. Manag.* 16, 28–43. doi: 10.46754/jssm.2021.12.003
- Laining, A., Usman, U., and Syah, R. (2017). Nutritive value of copra cake meal fermented with *Rhizopus* spp. and its use as a protein source in practical diets for rabbitfish (*Siganus javus*). *J. Appl. Aquac.* 29, 307–321. doi: 10.1080/10454438.2017.1359726
- Li, L., Liu, H., and Zhang, P. (2022). Effect of spirulina meal supplementation on growth performance and feed utilization in fish and dhrimp: a meta-analysis. *Aquac. Nutr.* 2022, 8517733. doi: 10.1155/2022/8517733
- Mamaug, R. E. P., Ragaza, J. A., and Nacionales, T. (2019). Fish performance, nutrient digestibilities, and hepatic and intestinal morphologies in grouper *Epinephelus fuscoguttatus* fed fermented copra meal. *Aquac. Rep.* 14, 100202. doi: 10.1016/j.aqrep.2019.100202
- Millar, K. A., Gallagher, E., Burke, R., McCarthy, S., and Barry-Ryan, C. (2019). Proximate composition and anti-nutritional factors of fava-bean (*Vicia faba*), green-pea and yellow-pea (*Pisum sativum*) flour. *J. Food Compos. Anal.* 82, 103233. doi: 10.1016/j.jfca.2019.103233
- Moyo, N., and Rapatsa-Malatji, M. (2023). A review and meta-analysis of selected plant protein sources as a replacement of fishmeal in the diet of tilapias. *Ann. Anim. Sci.* 2022, 84. doi: 10.2478/aoas-2022-0084
- Mugwanya, M., Dawood, M. A. O., Kimera, F., and Sewilam, H. (2022). Replacement of fish meal with fermented plant proteins in the aquafeed industry: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Rev. Aquac.* 15, 62–88. doi: 10.1111/raq.12701
- Ramakrishnan, S. R., Jeong, C. R., Park, J. W., Cho, S. S., and Kim, S. J. (2023). A review on the processing of functional proteins or peptides derived from fish by-products and their industrial applications. *Heliyon* 2023, e14188. doi: 10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e14188
- Samaddar, A. (2018). A review of fish meal replacement with fermented biodegradable organic wastes in aquaculture. *Int. J. Fish. Aquat. Stud.* 6, 203–208.
- Tran, H. Q., Nguyen, T. T., Prokešová, M., Gebauer, T., Doan, H. V., and Stejskal, V. (2022). Systematic review and meta-analysis of production performance of aquaculture species fed dietary insect meals. *Rev. Aquac.* 14, 1637–1655. doi: 10.1111/raq.12666
- Trevi, S., Uren Webster, T., Consuerga, S., and Garcia de Leaniz, C. (2023). Benefits of the microalgae *Spirulina* and *Schizochytrium* in fish nutrition: a meta-analysis. *Sci. Rep.* 13, 2208. doi: 10.1038/s41598-023-29183-x
- Wu, D. T., Li, W. X., Wan, J. J., Hu, Y. C., Gan, R. Y., and Zou, L. (2023). A comprehensive review of pea (*Pisum sativum* L.): chemical composition, processing, health benefits, and food applications. *Foods* 12, 2527. doi: 10.3390/foods12132527
- Yi, Z., Xu, M., Di, X., Brynjolfsson, S., and Fu, W. (2017). Exploring valuable lipids in diatoms. *Front. Mar. Sci.* 4, 17. doi: 10.3389/fmars.2017.00017