



Commentary: Why sprint interval training is inappropriate for a largely sedentary population

Fabrício B. Del Vecchio¹, Paulo Gentil², Victor S. Coswig^{1*} and David H. Fukuda³

¹ Department of Performance and Human Metabolism, Superior School of Physical Education, Federal University of Pelotas, Pelotas, Brazil, ² Department of Physical Education, University of Brasilia, Brasilia, Brazil, ³ Department of Exercise Physiology, Institute of Exercise Physiology and Wellness, University of Central Florida, Orlando, FL, USA

Keywords: exercise psychology, sprint interval training, exercise intensity, behavior change, feeling states, exercise adherence

A commentary on

OPEN ACCESS

Edited by:

Gian Mauro Manzoni,
eCampus University, Italy

Reviewed by:

Melanie M. Adams,
Keene State College, USA
Danice Brown Greer,
The University at Tyler, USA
Erica Aneke Hinckson,
Auckland University of Technology,
New Zealand

*Correspondence:

Victor S. Coswig,
vcoswig@gmail.com

Specialty section:

This article was submitted to
Psychology for Clinical Settings,
a section of the journal
Frontiers in Psychology

Received: 03 July 2015

Accepted: 24 August 2015

Published: 07 September 2015

Citation:

Del Vecchio FB, Gentil P, Coswig VS
and Fukuda DH (2015) Commentary:
Why sprint interval training is
inappropriate for a largely sedentary
population. *Front. Psychol.* 6:1359.
doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2015.01359

Why sprint interval training is inappropriate for a largely sedentary population

by Hardcastle, S. J., Ray, H., Beale, L., and Hagger, M. S. (2014). *Front. Psychol.* 5:1505. doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2014.01505

In this commentary, we explain why the recent manuscript by Hardcastle et al. (2014), which conveyed the opinion that sprint interval training (SIT) is inappropriate for sedentary individuals, may be misguided and propose an alternate view on this issue. Specifically, the main disagreements to consider involve reduced pleasure, self-esteem, adherence, and motivation with SIT, as well as the potential complexities involved with controlling exercise intensities.

Minimal doses of exercise for health are somewhat limited within exercise recommendations (Garber et al., 2011) which tend to gravitate toward moderate intensity continuous exercise (MICE). However, it appears that 150 min/week of MICE is insufficient for weight loss/regain and to influence obesity-related risk factors (Church et al., 2009). Thus, interval-based training at varying intensities is advocated to address health and disease (Gibala et al., 2012). With ~31% of the world's population being sedentary (Hallal et al., 2012), those who aim to improve previously mentioned health goals, SIT, which is a specific type of high-intensity intermittent training (HIIT; Buchheit and Laursen, 2013), may be an advantageous exercise strategy (Del Vecchio et al., 2013).

To advocate for decreased pleasure with increasing intensity, Hardcastle et al. (2014) employ a review article that at no point mentions HIIT or SIT but primarily focused on continuous exercise at ~85% of VO₂ reserve (Ekkekakis et al., 2011). In a direct comparison of single MICE or HIIT sessions, Oliveira et al. (2013) observed greater ratings of perceived exertion during HIIT, but no difference in physical activity enjoyment between the two types of exercise. In addition to the lack of reference to SIT or HIIT in the currently discussed Opinion Article (Hardcastle et al., 2014), the authors employ an “invited paper” (Parfitt and Hughes, 2009) which focuses on self-selected exercise intensity and self-regulation to support the notion that “enjoyment is also a predictor of exercise adherence and most people do not enjoy high intensity exercise.” Contrary to the suggestions, in a controlled trial, HIIT was shown to be more enjoyable than MICE (Bartlett et al., 2011). Similar results were found in varying populations (Crisp et al., 2012; Jung et al., 2015; Martinez et al., 2015), however, long-term evaluation is still needed.

It is our opinion that the motivation provided by positive health improvements and the time-efficiency of SIT/HIIT exceeds their potential aversive effects. Moreover, the assumption that these protocols have low adherence is not confirmed, with studies in elderly individuals showing a preference for interval protocols (Guiraud et al., 2011) and lengthy training studies (up to 9 months) reporting adherence greater than 90% with HIIT in obese participants and people with joint disorders (Gremeaux et al., 2012; Bressel et al., 2014). The only study cited by Hardcastle et al. (2014) to question adherence to intense protocols is by Perri et al. (2002) which involved the comparison of two continuous exercise sessions carried out between 40–55% and 65–75% of HRreserve. In fact, the results of this study highlight potential issues with current MICE recommendations, including decreased adherence and limitations with regard to training volume using selected intensities for steady-state exercise. Interestingly, results from a systematic review showed that 12mos of MICE resulted in less than 2 kg of weight loss (Avenell et al., 2004), while others have advocated the use of HIIT for improvements in body composition (Boutcher, 2011).

Further, SIT has shown to improve motivation, particularly with regard to appearance and maintenance of body mass, as well as quality of life scores in elderly sedentary people (Knowles et al., 2015). Contradicting the assumptions made by Hardcastle et al. (2014), results from a randomized controlled trial showed that 6 weeks of SIT lead to improvement in the perception of health and mood of sedentary women (30–65 years) at risk for metabolic syndrome (Freese et al., 2014).

The studies used to convince the reader that SIT is strenuous and can increase feelings of low self-esteem, potential failure, and incompetence tended to address generic issues and did not specifically involve SIT or HIIT (Hein and Hagger, 2007; Lindwall et al., 2011). Furthermore, self-discipline and self-regulation, presented as necessary factors to achieve success with SIT, are essential for any behavior change. Thus, engagement in exercise for health is a behavioral decision.

Additionally, the sense of self-esteem, motivation, and competence is relative and can be enhanced by health professionals, as we believe that few people should perform exercise without supervision or guidance with regard to medical clearance, gradual progression, and appropriate monitoring. In this context, the exercise intensity is relative to the individual's current health and emotional status. Often sedentary or obese people and individual's with medical restrictions, have such low physical fitness that it would be impossible to conduct MICE. For example, a person with COPD, if a 30 min exercise is recommended, should exercise at 2.4–3.5 km/h (Rugbjerg et al., 2015), which may result in complications, including, but not limited to, joint pain, diaper rash, and general discomfort as reported by obese individuals during this type of training.

Hardcastle et al. (2014) argue that intensity control during SIT is complex. However, proper control of MICE requires expensive and complex equipment to quantify intensities, such as heart rate monitors, global positioning systems, and/or devices to report external loads (speed, load, inclination, etc.). In contrast, the interval-training model proposed by Tabata et al. (1996) can be conducted using minimal equipment, with physiological adaptations equivalent to those obtained with MICE (McRae et al., 2012). Regarding the use of extended rest/recovery periods between exercise intervals, SIT models are flexible and Matsuo et al. (2014) reported superior results using a protocol lasting only 7 min compared to a 45 min MICE session, further highlighting the time efficient nature of this approach.

Hardcastle et al. (2014) should be commended for potentially furthering the research agenda surrounding the beneficial effects of SIT. In closing, it should be recognized that the development of training programs should not be limited to a single exercise methodology (Del Vecchio et al., 2013), and that, in addition to SIT and MICE, other modes, including progressive strength training and leisure/recreational activities, should also be utilized in the sedentary population.

References

- Avenell, A., Brown, T. J., McGee, M. A., Campbell, M. K., Grant, A. M., Broom, J., et al. (2004). What interventions should we add to weight reducing diets in adults with obesity? A systematic review of randomized controlled trials of adding drug therapy, exercise, behaviour therapy or combinations of these interventions. *J. Hum. Nutr. Diet.* 17, 293–316. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-277X.2004.00530.x
- Bartlett, J. D., Close, G. L., MacLaren, D. P., Gregson, W., Drust, B., and Morton, J. P. (2011). High-intensity interval running is perceived to be more enjoyable than moderate-intensity continuous exercise: implications for exercise adherence. *J. Sports Sci.* 29, 547–553. doi: 10.1080/02640414.2010.545427
- Boutcher, S. H. (2011). High-intensity intermittent exercise and fat loss. *J. Obes.* 2011:868305. doi: 10.1155/2011/868305
- Bressel, E., Wing, J. E., Miller, A. I., and Dolny, D. G. (2014). High-intensity interval training on an aquatic treadmill in adults with osteoarthritis: effect on pain, balance, function, and mobility. *J. Strength Cond. Res.* 28, 2088–2096. doi: 10.1519/JSC.0000000000000258
- Buchheit, M., and Laursen, P. B. (2013). High-intensity interval training, solutions to the programming puzzle: part I: cardiopulmonary emphasis. *Sports Med.* 43, 313–338. doi: 10.1007/s40279-013-0029-x
- Church, T. S., Martin, C. K., Thompson, A. M., Earnest, C. P., Mikus, C. R., and Blair, S. N. (2009). Changes in weight, waist circumference and compensatory responses with different doses of exercise among sedentary, overweight postmenopausal women. *PLoS ONE* 4:e4515. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0004515
- Crisp, N. A., Fournier, P. A., Licari, M. K., Braham, R., and Guelfi, K. J. (2012). Optimising sprint interval exercise to maximise energy expenditure and enjoyment in overweight boys. *Appl. Physiol. Nutr. Metab.* 37, 1222–1231. doi: 10.1139/h2012-111
- Del Vecchio, F. B., Galliano, L. M., and Coswig, V. S. (2013). Applications of high-intensity intermittent exercise on metabolic syndrome. *Rev. Bras. Ativ. Fis Saúde* 18, 669–687. doi: 10.12820/rbaf.v.18n6p669
- Ekkekakis, P., Parfitt, G., and Petruzzello, S. J. (2011). The pleasure and displeasure people feel when they exercise at different intensities: decennial update and progress towards a tripartite rationale for exercise intensity prescription. *Sports Med.* 1, 641–671. doi: 10.2165/11590680-000000000-00000
- Freese, E. C., Acitelli, R. M., Gist, N. H., Cureton, K. J., Evans, E. M., and O'Connor, P. J. (2014). Effect of six weeks of sprint interval training on mood and perceived health in women at risk for metabolic syndrome. *J. Sport Exerc. Psychol.* 6, 610–618. doi: 10.1123/jsep.2014-0083

- Garber, C. E., Blissmer, B., Deschenes, M. R., Franklin, B. A., Lamonte, M. J., Lee, I. M., et al. (2011). American College of Sports Medicine position stand. Quantity and quality of exercise for developing and maintaining cardiorespiratory, musculoskeletal, and neuromotor fitness in apparently healthy adults: guidance for prescribing exercise. *Med. Sci. Sports Exerc.* 43, 1334–1359. doi: 10.1249/MSS.0b013e318213febf
- Gibala, M. J., Little, J. P., MacDonald, M. J., and Hawley, J. A. (2012). Physiological adaptations to low-volume, high-intensity interval training in health and disease. *J. Physiol.* 590, 1077–1084. doi: 10.1113/jphysiol.2011.224725
- Gremeaux, V., Drigny, J., Nigam, A., Juneau, M., Guilbeault, V., Latour, E., et al. (2012). Long-term lifestyle intervention with optimized high-intensity interval training improves body composition, cardiometabolic risk, and exercise parameters in patients with abdominal obesity. *Am. J. Phys. Med. Rehabil.* 91, 941–950. doi: 10.1097/PHM.0b013e3182643ce0
- Guiraud, T., Nigam, A., Juneau, M., Meyer, P., Gayda, M., and Bosquet, L. (2011). Acute responses to high-intensity intermittent exercise in CHD patients. *Med. Sci. Sports Exerc.* 43, 211–217. doi: 10.1249/MSS.0b013e3181ebc5de
- Hallal, P. C., Andersen, L. B., Bull, F. C., Guthold, R., Haskell, W., and Ekelund, U. (2012). Global physical activity levels: surveillance progress, pitfalls, and prospects. *Lancet* 21, 247–257. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(12)60646-1
- Hardcastle, S. J., Ray, H., Beale, L., and Hagger, M. S. (2014). Why sprint interval training is inappropriate for a largely sedentary population. *Front. Psychol.* 5:1505. doi: 10.3389/fpsyg.2014.01505
- Hein, V., and Hagger, M. S. (2007). Global self-esteem, goal achievement orientations and self-determined behavioral regulations in physical education setting. *J. Sports Sci.* 25, 149–259. doi: 10.1080/02640410600598315
- Jung, M. E., Bourne, J. E., Beauchamp, M. R., Robinson, E., and Little, J. P. (2015). High-intensity interval training as an efficacious alternative to moderate-intensity continuous training for adults with prediabetes. *J. Diabetes Res.* 2015:191595. doi: 10.1155/2015/191595
- Knowles, A. M., Herbert, P., Easton, C., Schulthorpe, N., and Grace, F. M. (2015). Impact of low-volume, high-intensity interval training on maximal aerobic capacity, health-related quality of life and motivation to exercise in ageing men. *Age* 37, 25. doi: 10.1007/s11357-015-9763-3
- Lindwall, M., Larsson, P., and Hagger, M. S. (2011). The reciprocal relationship between physical activity and depression in older European adults: a prospective cross-aggged panel design using SHAR Edata. *Health Psychol.* 30, 453–462. doi: 10.1037/a0023268
- Martinez, N., Kilpatrick, M. W., Salomon, K., Jung, M. E., and Little, J. P. (2015). Affective and enjoyment responses to high-intensity interval training in overweight-to-obese and insufficiently active adults. *J. Sport Exerc. Psychol.* 2, 138–149. doi: 10.1123/jsep.2014-0212
- Matsuo, T., Saotome, K., Seino, S., Shimojo, N., Matsushita, A., Iemitsu, M., et al. (2014). Effects of a low-volume aerobic-type interval exercise on VO₂max and cardiac mass. *Med. Sci. Sports Exerc.* 46, 42–50. doi: 10.1249/MSS.0b013e3182a38da8
- McRae, G., Payne, A., Zelt, J. G., Scribbans, T. D., Jung, M. E., Little, J. P., et al. (2012). Extremely low volume, whole-body aerobic-resistance training improves aerobic fitness and muscular endurance in females. *Appl. Physiol. Nutr. Metab.* 37, 1124–1131. doi: 10.1139/h2012-093
- Oliveira, B. R., Slama, F. A., Deslandes, A. C., Furtado, E. S., and Santos, T. M. (2013). Continuous and high-intensity interval training: which promotes higher pleasure? *PLoS ONE* 26:e79965. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0079965
- Parfitt, G., and Hughes, S. (2009). The exercise intensity–affect relationship: evidence and implications for exercise behavior. *J. Exerc. Sci. Fit.* 2, S34–S41. doi: 10.1016/S1728-869X(09)60021-6
- Perri, M. G., Anton, S. D., Durning, P. E., Ketterson, T. U., Sydemann, S. J., Berlant, N. E., et al. (2002). Adherence to exercise prescriptions: effects of prescribing moderate versus higher levels of intensity and frequency. *Health Psychol.* 21, 452–458. doi: 10.1037/0278-6133.21.5.452
- Rugbjerg, M., Iepsen, U. W., Jorgensen, K. J., and Lange, P. (2015). Effectiveness of pulmonary rehabilitation in COPD with mild symptoms: a systematic review with meta-analyses. *Int. J. Chron. Obstruct. Pulmon. Dis.* 10, 791–801. doi: 10.2147/COPD.S78607
- Tabata, I., Nishimura, K., Kouzaki, K., Hirai, Y., Ogita, F., Miyachi, M., et al. (1996). Effects of moderate-intensity endurance and high intensity intermittent training on anaerobic capacity and VO₂max. *Med. Sci. Sports Exerc.* 10, 1327–1330. doi: 10.1097/00005768-199610000-00018

Conflict of Interest Statement: The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

Copyright © 2015 Del Vecchio, Gentil, Coswig and Fukuda. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) or licensor are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.