Check for updates

OPEN ACCESS

EDITED BY Ondřej Plíhal, Palacky´ University, Czechia

REVIEWED BY Markéta Pernisová Masaryk University, Czechia Daniel V. Savatin, University of Tuscia, Italy

*CORRESPONDENCE Peter Marhavý peter.marhavy@slu.se

RECEIVED 29 August 2023 ACCEPTED 19 October 2023 PUBLISHED 13 November 2023

CITATION

Guerreiro J and Marhavý P (2023) Unveiling the intricate mechanisms of plant defense. Front. Plant Physiol. 1:1285373. [doi: 10.3389/fphgy.2023.1285373](https://doi.org/10.3389/fphgy.2023.1285373)

COPYRIGHT

© 2023 Guerreiro and Marhavy´. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/) [License \(CC BY\).](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/) The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) and the copyright owner(s) are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.

[Unveiling the intricate](https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fphgy.2023.1285373/full) [mechanisms of plant defense](https://www.frontiersin.org/articles/10.3389/fphgy.2023.1285373/full)

Julie Guerreiro and Peter Marhavý*

Umea Plant Science Centre (UPSC), Department of Forest Genetics and Plant Physiology, Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences, Umea, Sweden

Plants may lack mobility, but they are not defenseless against the constant threats posed by pathogens and pests. Pattern Recognition Receptors (PRRs), which are located on the plasma membrane, enable plants to effectively recognize intruders. These receptors function by sensing elicitors or fragments of the cell wall that arise from damage. Recent studies underscore the significance of maintaining cell wall integrity in the coordination of defense mechanisms following the detection of parasitism. Pathogen invasion often triggers alterations in cell wall structure, which leads to the release of molecules like β -glucans and oligogalacturonides. These small molecules are then recognized by PRRs, which stimulate downstream signaling pathways that involve both receptor-like kinases and calcium-dependent signaling. Here, we present the latest insights into plant signaling that play a vital role in immunity: the maintenance of cell wall integrity; the intricate interplay between receptor-like kinases; and the involvement of calcium ions. The goal of the review is to provide readers with a deeper understanding of the intricate mechanisms underlying plant defense strategies.

KEYWORDS

cell wall, calcium, damage, immune responses, pathogens

Introduction

The sessile nature of the plant kingdom has driven the evolution of intricate signaling mechanisms that can effectively detect, as well as combat, the biotic stresses imposed by pathogens and pests [\(Glazebrook, 2005](#page-6-0)). The plant cell wall serves as the primary barrier against these stressors, and is crucial not only for protection, but also for sensing external attack [\(Cosgrove, 2005](#page-6-0)). In the quest to identify potential threats, plants have developed a sophisticated surveillance system that relies on the recognition of distinct molecules known as microbe-associated molecular patterns (MAMPs), pathogen-associated molecular patterns (PAMPs), damage-associated molecular patterns (DAMPs), and even herbivoreassociated molecular patterns (HAMPs) [\(Chisholm et al., 2006](#page-6-0)). These molecular patterns are detected by specialized pattern recognition receptors (PRRs) [\(Jones and Dangl, 2006](#page-7-0)) as well as surface receptors, e.g., receptor-like kinases (RLKs) and wall-associated kinases (WAKs) [\(Decreux and Messiaen, 2005;](#page-6-0) [Decreux et al., 2006\)](#page-6-0). Recent advances have provided insight into how plants maintain cell wall integrity ([Bacete and Hamann,](#page-5-0) [2020\)](#page-5-0). In addition to orchestrating the immune response, the cell wall has the vital function of detecting both mechanical and pathogen-induced stress [\(Cosgrove, 2005](#page-6-0)). Specific RLKs play pivotal roles in detecting cell wall damages and can engage plant defense complexes to subsequently initiate pattern-triggered immunity (PTI). Alongside protons (H^+) , calcium (Ca^{2+}) has recently emerged as a pivotal bivalent cation that is essential for plant nutrition, cellular structure, and stress responses [\(Thor, 2019\)](#page-7-0). In plants, the maintenance of the cell wall integrity along with the perception of cell wall damages, are intricately linked to Ca^{2+} ions, which can participate in the cross-linking of negative charges at the cell wall interface; as such, the cell wall is effectively a Ca^{2+} reservoir in plants ([Hepler and Winship, 2010](#page-7-0)). In plants, the primary role of $Ca²⁺$ is to transmit electrical signals to neighboring cells and other plant organs so that specific messages can be relayed once distinct cues are detected ([Bush, 1995;](#page-6-0) [Choi et al., 2017](#page-6-0)). Interestingly, recent research has revealed that calcium ions act as crucial secondary messengers during cell wall damages perception, cell wall integrity regulation, and the plant immune response.

In this review, we initially describe the realm of cell wall-related plant immunity with a specific focus on the role of RLKs in both plant defense mechanisms and cell wall integrity regulation. Next, we explore the emerging evidence that Ca^{2+} acts as a pivotal secondary messenger in both cell wall integrity regulation and plant immunity.

Plant cell wall perception and signaling in immune responses

The plant cell wall (CW) serves as the primary barrier for deterring pathogens; as such, there has been strong evolutionary pressure for the development of cell wall perception, remodeling, and reinforcement mechanisms in plant defense strategies [\(Cosgrove,](#page-6-0) [2005](#page-6-0); [Glazebrook, 2005](#page-6-0)). The primary cell wall is predominantly composed of oligosaccharides (e.g., cellulose, hemicellulose, and pectin), while the secondary cell wall has a similar composition but lower lignin content [\(Bidlack, 1992;](#page-6-0) [Cosgrove and Jarvis, 2012\)](#page-6-0). Additionally, the plant cell wall contains a substantial proportion of proteins, which account for approximately one-tenth of the total biomass [\(Keller, 1993;](#page-7-0) [Cassab, 1998\)](#page-6-0). These proteins play a pivotal role in modifying the CW, facilitating perception, and enabling signal transduction. Recent empirical findings highlight how the maintenance of CW integrity is critical to detecting parasitism and monitoring plant defense responses [\(Vaahtera et al., 2019;](#page-8-0) [Wan et al.,](#page-8-0) [2021](#page-8-0)). Intrusion by pathogens or parasites is frequently correlated with changes in CW structure ([Gigli-Bisceglia et al., 2020\)](#page-6-0). For instance, pathogens secrete cell-wall degrading enzymes (CWDEs), such as cellulases, glucanases, and xylanases ([van den Brink and de](#page-8-0) [Vries, 2011](#page-8-0)), and the action of these enzymes releases various elicitors into the apoplast. These elicitors include β -1,2-glucans, degradation product of cellulose, β -1,3-glucans, degradation product of callose, and α -1,4-oligogalacturonides (OGs), which is the degradation product of pectins. As a result of cell wall degradation, Ca^{2+} cations, which were originally present in the pectin and hemicellulose components of the cell wall, are released into the apoplast ([Jarvis, 1982;](#page-7-0) [Engelsdorf et al.,](#page-6-0)

[2016\)](#page-6-0). This triggers an influx of Ca^{2+} into the cytoplasm [\(Clapham,](#page-6-0) [2007\)](#page-6-0). The degradation products of CWDE activity fall under a class of molecules known as DAMPs, which are recognized by pattern PRRs ([Bacete and Hamann, 2020](#page-5-0); [Souza et al., 2017\)](#page-7-0). Following the perception of cell wall damage, PRRs transmit downstream signals via receptor-like kinases (RLKs) or calcium (Ca^{2+}) -dependent signaling to ultimately initiate MAPK signaling cascades, which stimulates the production of phytohormones such as jasmonate (JA), salicylic acid (SA), ethylene (ET), and abscisic acid (ABA) [\(Figure 1,](#page-2-0) [Zhou and](#page-8-0) [Zhang, 2020\)](#page-8-0). The rapid influx of Ca^{2+} into the cytoplasm activates enzymes that are responsible for the biosynthesis of phytohormones, as well as stimulates the transcription factors that regulate genes linked with phytohormone production ([Zhou and Zhang, 2020\)](#page-8-0). Changes in apoplastic Ca^{2+} levels also mediate cell wall loosening and adjustments via the action of PECTIN METHYL-TRANSFERASES (PMEs), which require Ca^{2+} for activation and the cross-linking of pectin [\(Wu et al.,](#page-8-0) [2018;](#page-8-0) [Gale et al., 2019](#page-6-0)). Moreover, shifts in distinct phytohormone pools will activate the expression of specific genes, leading to modifications in MAPKs signaling and subsequent changes in cell wall structure and the defense response ([Engelsdorf and](#page-6-0) [Hamann, 2014](#page-6-0); [Miedes et al., 2014;](#page-7-0) [Zipfel, 2014](#page-8-0); [Bacete et al., 2017;](#page-5-0) [Wolf, 2017\)](#page-8-0).

The membrane-localized PRRs are a central part of how plants detect damage from external pathogens via the perception of PAMPs/DAMPs/MAMPs. Among these, the most extensively studied is the LRR-RKs receptor FLAGELLIN-SENSING2 (FLS2), which operates in conjunction with the co-receptor BRASSINOSTEROID INSENSITIVE 1-ASSOCIATED KINASE 1 (BAK1 or SERK3) from the SOMATIC EMBRYOGENESIS RECEPTOR KINASES (SERK) family ([Table 1,](#page-3-0) Gomé[z-Gome](#page-6-0)́z [and Boller, 2000;](#page-6-0) [Chinchilla et al., 2007;](#page-6-0) [Heese et al., 2007\)](#page-6-0). In terms of the mechanism, FLS2 binds the PAMP-peptide flg22, which promotes FLS2/BAK1/BIK1 complex formation and the subsequent phosphorylation of BOTRYTIS INDUCED KINASE 1 (BIK1) cytoplasmic domains by BRI1-ASSOCIATED RECEPTOR KINASE 1 (BAK1) [\(Lu et al., 2010](#page-7-0)). These phosphorylation events are sensed by RECEPTOR-LIKE CYTOPLASMIC KINASES (RLCKs) to initiate phosphorylation cascades that culminate in the activation of target proteins; this is an example of PAMPtriggered immunity (PTI) [\(Liang and Zhou, 2018;](#page-7-0) [DeFalco and](#page-6-0) [Zipfel, 2021\)](#page-6-0). Another significant LRR-RK receptor, PEPR1, has recently emerged as a key player in the perception of CW damages ([Yamaguchi et al., 2010\)](#page-8-0). Like FLS2, PEPR1 is a ligand-specific receptor that recognizes the endogenous peptide signal DAMPassociated PEPTIDE 1 (AtPep1). This AtPep1 peptide forms following the C-terminal cleavage of AtProPep1, a product of the PROPEP1 gene. PROPEP1 expression is strongly induced during cell wall degradation, wound responses, and the recognition of elicitors such as jasmonic acid (JA) and ethylene (Et) [\(Huffaker](#page-7-0) [et al., 2006](#page-7-0)). PEPR1 also operates by activating the immune response, which exemplifies the convergence of bacterial elicitor sensing and the perception of degradation products from cell wall damage. The modes of action of both FLS2 and PEPR1, which are members of the LRR-RKs family, highlight the intricate interplay between MAMP/PAMP recognition and the perception of cell wall degradation products ([Figure 1;](#page-2-0) [Table 1](#page-3-0)).

the signal to the cytoplasm. This signal consists in Ca²⁺ channels and RBOHD activation, leading to an oxidative burst and Ca²⁺ influx. RLCKs are also PRR activated and phosphorylated, leading to Ca²⁺ channel activation such as CNGCs. The different Ca²⁺ influx transduce a specific Ca²⁺ signature decoded via CPS CMLs, CBLs, CDPKs or CIPKS. The different CPS will then specifically TF to induce defence or cell wall maintenance related genes. PRR are also directly activating MAPKs cascade signalling leading also to TF activation and defence genes expression. The different genes activated will in turn activate specific phytohormones biosynthesis as well as cell modification enzyme or components (e.g., lignin).

The intricate role of receptor kinases in calcium signaling and cell wall perception

WALL-ASSOCIATED KINASES (WAKs) are a type of pattern recognition receptors (PRRs) that are responsible for detecting oligogalacturonides (OGs), the degradation products of pectin ([Brutus et al., 2010\)](#page-6-0). The WAK-like (WAKL) family, which comprises 26 members in Arabidopsis thaliana, plays a crucial role in this process ([Verica and He, 2002\)](#page-8-0). More specifically, WAK1 and WAK2 are receptors that can bind OGs, yet require Ca^{2+} for binding to the OG backbone [\(Vallarino and Osorio, 2012;](#page-8-0) [Benedetti et al.,](#page-6-0) [2015](#page-6-0)). While WAK1 is not directly involved in early PTI, it eventually forms a complex with FLS2 [\(Danna et al., 2012](#page-6-0)). WAKL5 and WALK7 are induced in response to mechanical damage ([Verica et al., 2003](#page-8-0)). Following the perception of OGs, WAK1 and WAK2 activate downstream signaling pathways via stimulating a Ca^{2+} influx, reactive oxygen species (ROS) production, CDPK activation, and MAPK3,6 phosphorylation, all of which can subsequently activate the transcription of genes linked with the defense response [\(Brutus et al., 2010](#page-6-0); [Galletti et al., 2011;](#page-6-0) [Kohorn and Kohorn, 2012;](#page-7-0) [Gravino et al., 2015](#page-6-0)). The redundancy

among the WAKL genes complicates the comprehensive characterization of specific functions; as such, further investigation is required because distinct WAKL members appear to be differentially involved in the specific defense responses against pests across various crop species [\(Li et al., 2009;](#page-7-0) [Hurni et al., 2015;](#page-7-0) [Zuo et al., 2015;](#page-8-0) [Tripathi et al., 2021](#page-8-0); [Barghahn et al., 2021](#page-5-0)). Another PRR receptor that is activated upon OG binding is the PROLINE-RICH EXTENSIN-LIKE RECEPTOR KINASE 4 (PERK4). Unlike members of the WAK family, PERK4 binds pectin and is involved in cell-wall loosening. Remarkably, PERK4 can inhibit root growth by stimulating ABA signaling and, intriguingly, disrupts Ca^{2+} homeostasis to induce CW loosening under mechanical stress ([Bai](#page-5-0) [et al., 2009\)](#page-5-0). LYSIN MOTIF-RECEPTOR KINASE 5 (LYK5) and CHITIN ELICITOR RECEPTOR KINASE 1 (CERK1/LYK1) represent well-documented PRRs that are essential for the recognition of chitin, which is a fungal elicitor ([Petutschnig et al.,](#page-7-0) [2010;](#page-7-0) [Liu et al., 2012;](#page-7-0) [Cao et al., 2014\)](#page-6-0). CERK1, in particular, has a critical role in glycan-based MAMP perception and was recently identified as vital for $1,3-\beta-D$ -glucan-triggered immunity in Plectosphaerella cucumerina (Mé[lida et al., 2018\)](#page-7-0). CERK1 initiates ROS production via the Rho GTPase pathway, which triggers an oxidative burst that prompts a Ca^{2+} influx. Upon sensing this transient increase in Ca^{2+} levels, CDPK activates downstream

TABLE 1 Membrane localized Pattern-Recognition-Receptors (PRRs) and their specific DAMPS identified in in Arabidopsis thaliana.

OGs, o/igoga/acturonides; Nd, Not determined; LRR, Leucin-Rich Repeat; ROS, Reactive Oxygen Species; MAPK, Mitogen-Activated Protein Kinase.

signaling cascades that trigger specific immune responses [\(Cao et al.,](#page-6-0) [2014;](#page-6-0) [Keinath et al., 2015;](#page-7-0) [Espinoza et al., 2017](#page-6-0); [Yuan et al., 2017](#page-8-0)).

Recently, MALECTIN-LIKE RECEPTOR KINASES (MLRKs) or Catharanthus roseus RECEPTOR-LIKE KINASE 1-LIKE PROTEINS (CrRLK1Ls) have received increased research attention. At present, 17 members of this family have been identified, with 10 well-characterized in Arabidopsis thaliana ([Lindner et al., 2012;](#page-7-0) [Li et al., 2016;](#page-7-0) [Nissen et al., 2016;](#page-7-0) [Franck](#page-6-0) [et al., 2018](#page-6-0)). Prior research has shown that CrRLK1Ls are involved in various cellular processes, including cell growth, morphogenesis, reproduction, hormone signaling, immunity, and stress responses ([Duan et al., 2010;](#page-6-0) [Schoenaers et al., 2017;](#page-7-0) [Feng et al., 2018](#page-6-0); [Solis-](#page-7-0)[Miranda et al., 2021\)](#page-7-0).

The THESEUS1 (THE1) and FERONIA/SIRENE (FER/SIR) receptors, both of which are MLRKs, were recently found to perceive cell wall damage as well as play key roles in innate plant immunity ([Franck et al., 2018;](#page-6-0) [Bacete and Hamann, 2020;](#page-5-0) [Gonneau](#page-6-0) [et al., 2018\)](#page-6-0). In this signaling cascade, THE1 operates upstream of MID1-COMPLEMENTING ACTIVITY 1 (MCA1), with the activation of signaling ultimately inducing jasmonic acid (JA), salicylic acid (SA), and lignin production [\(Figure 1,](#page-2-0) [Denness](#page-6-0) [et al., 2011](#page-6-0)); this chain of signaling hints at collaborative interactions between maintenance of CW integrity and immune responses during the reaction to biotic stressors [\(Furuichi et al.,](#page-6-0) [2012;](#page-6-0) [Engelsdorf et al., 2018](#page-6-0); [Basu and Haswell, 2020](#page-6-0); [Hématy et al.,](#page-6-0) [2007\)](#page-6-0). Research has also revealed that THE1 interacts with

GUANINE EXCHANGE FACTOR4 (GEF4) to elicit downstream responses, yet further exploration is needed to completely unravel the signaling pathway ([Qu et al., 2017](#page-7-0)). FER, a member of the CrRLK1Ls family, is also involved in CW integrity maintenance and has a direct impact on innate immunity. More specifically, FER can bind rapid alkalinization 23 (RALF23; peptide secreted in response to a rapid alkalinization of the extracellular compartment; [Blackburn et al., 2020](#page-6-0)) peptide OGs and trigger cell specific Ca^{2+} fluxes, especially in response to salt stress; thus, this receptor contributes to CW integrity stability ([Feng et al., 2018](#page-6-0)). Recent research has revealed that FER activity positively influences PTI by enhancing interactions between FLS2, BAK1, and EFR [\(Stegmann](#page-7-0) [et al., 2017](#page-7-0); [Smakowska-Luzan et al., 2018](#page-7-0)).

The recently identified CELLO-OLIGOMER RECEPTOR 1 (CORK1)/IMPAIRED IN GLYCAN PERCEPTION 1 (IGP1), which is an LRR/MALECTIN-RECEPTOR-LIKE KINASE (LRR-MAL-RLK), is involved in activating PTI upon the recognition of cello-oligomers, such as cellotriose, which are another degradation products of cellulose [\(Tseng et al., 2022;](#page-8-0) [Martin-Dacal et al., 2022\)](#page-7-0). In addition, IGP4 has been shown to be involved in plant immunity not only through the perception of cell wall damage, but also via the stimulation of Ca^{2+} influx following the binding of β -1,3/1,4 glucans and glucan-derived oligosaccharides (Martí[n-Dacal et al., 2023](#page-7-0); and [Rebaque et al., 2021](#page-7-0)). However, the downstream signaling mechanisms of the associated PRR have not yet been fully elucidated. Despite evidence that several CrRLK1Ls serve as sensors of CW integrity [\(Shimizu et al., 2010](#page-7-0)), the precise intracellular targets of this class of proteins, along with the signaling pathways involved, remain incompletely understood. As such, extensive experimental data is needed to better illuminate cell wall remodeling following exposure to both biotic and abiotic stressors. Moreover, further investigation of the signaling network (s) through which the newly identified CW integrity sensors transmit information across the cell wall is needed [\(Table 1\)](#page-3-0). The comprehensive characterization of FER exemplifies how cellspecific Ca^{2+} signals are triggered, and underscores the need for further research, which could potentially lead to the identification of additional cell-specific receptors and the associated $Ca²⁺$ signatures.

In another study, Arabidopsis plant tissue was treated with CW fragments, and the results demonstrated how exposure to cellobiose elicited the strongest cytosolic Ca^{2+} spike. Interestingly, separate treatment with the MAMP-peptide flg22 and cellobiose (DAMP) returned distinct calcium spikes, both of which had a quantifiable pattern ([Souza et al., 2017](#page-7-0)). This finding suggests that CW damages perception and PAMP recognition might operate synergistically, even if the responses exhibit distinct Ca^{2+} signatures; nevertheless, the evidence suggests that either can induce an immune response when activated alone. This novel perspective warrants further exploration of the intricacies of CW damages perception and PTI, as the conventional focus on individual elicitors might not comprehensively reflect all of the simultaneous environmental interactions that occur in plants following an attack by a pathogen.

In summary, numerous PRRs/RLKs demonstrate distinct and precise Ca^{2+} spikes ([Figure 1](#page-2-0)), frequently transmitted through CDPKs, when activated; this knowledge suggests that these receptors have a pivotal role in calcium-mediated signaling within plants. Deciphering which calcium-dependent signaling pathways are activated by distinct RLKs following damage perception has the potential to offer invaluable insight for the field of plant immunity.

Decoding Ca²⁺ signaling in plant immunity

Upon pathogen detection at the CW, diverse PRR signaling pathways coincide with rapid Ca^{2+} influx into the cytoplasm ([Figure 1](#page-2-0) ; [Clapham, 2007](#page-6-0); [Boller and Felix, 2009](#page-6-0); [Yu et al.,](#page-8-0) [2017;](#page-8-0) [DeFalco and Zipfel, 2021\)](#page-6-0). Ca^{2+} serves as a universal secondary messenger, yet can also exhibit specific concentration patterns which plant cells decode to adequately activate the immune response. Termed Ca^{2+} signatures, these transient fluctuations in $Ca²⁺$ levels depend on factors like duration and amplitude ([Knight,](#page-7-0) [1996\)](#page-7-0). Ca^{2+} signaling comprises three stages: (1) encoding a specific trigger via Ca^{2+} flux magnitude and duration; (2) decoding of these signals by specific sensor proteins; and (3) initiation of downstream responses ([Köhler et al., 1999;](#page-7-0) [Bhar et al., 2023](#page-6-0); [Köster et al., 2022\)](#page-7-0). $Ca²⁺$ signature features can be determined by the type of PAMPs/ MAMPs and their concentration [\(Yu et al., 2017](#page-8-0)). A Ca^{2+} influx primarily involves CYCLIC NUCLEOTIDE-GATED CHANNELS (CNGCs) [\(Kohler et al., 1999\)](#page-7-0), GLUTAMATE RECEPTOR-LIKE CHANNELS (GLRs) ([Lam et al., 1998](#page-7-0); [Wudick et al., 2018](#page-8-0); Alfi[eri](#page-5-0) [et al., 2020](#page-5-0)), and REDUCED HYPEROSMOLARITY INDUCED Ca²⁺ INCREASE (OSCA1) ([Yuan et al., 2014](#page-8-0)). The efflux of calcium ions involves Ca^{2+}/H^+ exchangers (CAXs) and autoinhibited Ca^2 + -ATPases (ACAs) [\(Geisler et al., 2000;](#page-6-0) [Shigaki and Hirschi, 2000;](#page-7-0) Garcí[a Bossi et al., 2020](#page-6-0)). PRRs can induce transient Ca²⁺ increases via three mechanisms: the generation of signaling molecules like ROS or cyclic nucleotide monophosphate (cNMP); direct activation of ion channels by binding to, and activating, $Ca²⁺$ pumps or channels; and the stimulation of downstream RLCKs to trigger ROS production and $Ca²⁺$ influx. For example, in Arabidopsis, during PAMP-induced signalling, two genes encoding the Ca^{2+} channels CNGC2 and CNGC4 are required ([Ma et al., 2012](#page-7-0); [Tian et al., 2019](#page-8-0)). CNGC2 and CNGC4 can form a channel that is phosphorylated by the effectorkinase BIK1, thus triggering Ca^{2+} influx into the cytosol [\(Tian et al.,](#page-8-0) [2019\)](#page-8-0). Studies also reported that PEPR/Pep-signalling during DAMPtriggered immunity generates Ca^{2+} burst through activation of CNGC2 and act synergistically with PAMP-receptor FLS2 ([Ma et al.,](#page-7-0) [2012\)](#page-7-0). Hence, the CNGC-mediated calcium influx establishes a crucial connection between the calcium-dependent immunity during PAMPtriggered immunity signalling pathways and PRR complex. Interestingly, it was also shown that the MRLK FER, involved in CW damages perception and CW integrity maintenance, can induce cellspecific calcium burst upon salt stress ([Feng et al., 2018](#page-6-0)).

These changes in cytosolic Ca^{2+} levels are sensed by Ca^{2+} SENSOR PROTEINS (CSPs), which relay information through downstream cascades ([Figure 1;](#page-2-0) [Ranty et al., 2016\)](#page-7-0). CSPs encompass CALMODULIN (CaM), CaM-LIKE PROTEINS (CMLs), CALCINEURIN B-LIKE PROTEINS (CBLs), and CALCIUM-DEPENDENT PROTEIN KINASES (CDPKs; CPKs in Arabidopsis) [\(Cheng et al., 2002;](#page-6-0) [Yang and Poovaiah, 2003;](#page-8-0) [Luan,](#page-7-0) [2009;](#page-7-0) Batistič [and Kudla, 2012;](#page-6-0) [Delormel and Boudsocq, 2019](#page-6-0)). CBLs interact with CBL-INTERACTING KINASES (CIPKs), while CDPKs are well-documented Ca^{2+} sensors that include phosphorylation sites within the CaM binding domain [\(Larrainzar et al., 2007](#page-7-0); [Xie et al.,](#page-8-0) [2012\)](#page-8-0). In response to changes in Ca^{2+} levels, CDPKs activate the kinase domains of downstream signaling molecules ([Harmon et al.,](#page-6-0) [1994;](#page-6-0) [Harper et al., 1994](#page-6-0); [Yoo and Harmon, 1996;](#page-8-0) [Schulz et al., 2013\)](#page-7-0). As such, CIPKs/CDPKs transform pathogen-induced $Ca²⁺$ signals into phosphorylation events [\(Seybold et al., 2014;](#page-7-0) [Delormel and](#page-6-0) [Boudsocq, 2019\)](#page-6-0). CDPKs directly influence ROS production, Ca^{2+} influx and transcriptional reprogramming [\(Kobayashi et al., 2007;](#page-7-0) [Boudsocq and Sheen, 2013](#page-6-0); [Dubiella et al., 2013](#page-6-0); [Shinya et al., 2014](#page-7-0)). In Arabidopsis, AtCPK4, AtCPK5, AtCPK6 and AtCPK11 are described as early transcriptional regulators in MAMP-signalling pathway ([Boudsocq et al., 2010](#page-6-0)). In Solanum tuberosum (St), StCDPK4/5 (At homologues: AtCPK5/6) induce ROS production by direct phosphorylation of the NADPH oxidase RBOHB ([Kobayashi et al., 2012](#page-7-0)). Although many studies and advances put CDPKs as a central regulator of Ca^{2+} -mediated stress and immune responses, further research, particularly studies involving elicitor treatment, is needed if we are to comprehensively understand the myriad roles of CDPKs in the immune response.

Well-documented Ca^{2+} sensors, like CCaMK, possess multiple phosphorylation sites [\(Larrainzar et al., 2007;](#page-7-0) [Xie et al., 2012\)](#page-8-0). This means that Ca^{2+} sensors could participate in various signaling pathways, and more research in Arabidopsis is needed to clarify the roles of these sensors in immunity, such as decoding the Ca^{2+}

spikes that arise following DAMP release and perception. While the role of Ca^{2+} influx in plant immunity is already quite well understood, clarifying the specific targets of various Ca^{2+} signatures remain an understudied aspect of the response to pathogens. This is especially relevant for differences in Ca^{2+} influx signatures are particularly relevant during ETI and HR.

Conclusion

Recent research has unveiled the intricate interplay between calcium-mediated signaling and the triggering of immune responses by the perception of pathogens and CW damage. Despite advancements in the field, a comprehensive understanding of how distinct Ca^{2+} signaling patterns correspond to specific elicitors, as well as how these patterns translate into effective immune reactions against pathogens, is lacking. To address these knowledge gaps, future research should apply the latest conceptual frameworks and analytical tools. High-resolution techniques, which could be used to monitor transient Ca^{2+} fluxes, are imperative for locating the subcellular sites at which cytosolic calcium fluxes occur. Furthermore, unraveling the intricate networks involving Ca^{2+} receptors could provide insight into how distinct Ca^{2+} signatures correspond with certain target proteins. In addition, understanding the interactions between Ca^{2+} and EF-hand domains in Ca^{2+} sensors could clarify the underlying mechanisms of these signaling proteins.

RLKs, particularly PRRs, are inducing $Ca²⁺$ bursts after activation and then modulate the downstream signalling necessary for PTI. However, the specific Ca^{2+} signatures induced by each specific PRRs remain enigmatic. Investigating calcium pumps at the single-cell level, could offer valuable insight into the dynamics of Ca^{2+} fluxes and the respective targets of this form of signaling. Ca^{2+} signaling has been shown to influence cell wall perception and modification, both of which are crucial aspects of plant defense against pathogen infection. More specifically, Ca^{2+} signaling regulates the activities of CWDE and the deposition of reinforcing components. This intricate interplay results in the finely tuned cell wall modifications that are pivotal to defense mechanisms in plants. In this way, plants can stimulate specific signaling pathways to fortify cell walls in a bid to hinder pathogen entry and constrain pathogen proliferation. In summary, exploring Ca^{2+} signaling in the context of plant immunity, especially the early detection of pathogens via cell wall damage perception, is critical to advancing our understanding of plant resilience.

References

Alfieri, A., Doccula, F. G., Pederzoli, R., Grenzi, M., Bonza, M. C., Luoni, L., et al. (2020). The structural bases for agonist diversity in an Arabidopsis thaliana glutamate receptor-like channel. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 117, 752–760. doi: [10.1073/](https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1905142117) [pnas.1905142117](https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1905142117)

Bacete, L., and Hamann, T. (2020). The role of mechanoperception in plant cell wall integrity maintenance. Plants 9, 574. doi: [10.3390/plants9050574](https://doi.org/10.3390/plants9050574)

Bacete, L., Mélida, H., Pattathil, S., Hahn, M. G., Molina, A., and Miedes, E. (2017). "Characterization of plant cell wall damage-associated molecular patterns regulating immune responses," in Plant pattern recognition receptors, methods in molecular biology. Eds. L. Shan and P. He (New York, NY: Springer New York), 13–23. doi: [10.1007/978-1-4939-6859-6_2](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4939-6859-6_2)

Author contributions

JG: Figure design, Writing – original draft. PM: Writing – original draft, Funding acquisition, Supervision, Writing – review & editing.

Funding

The author(s) declare financial support was received for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article. This work was supported by funds that were awarded to PM (Vetenskapsrådet grant 2019-05634, Knut and Alice Wallenberg Foundation (KAW 2022.0029-Fate)).

Acknowledgments

We apologize to authors whose relevant work we have not cited, either inadvertently or due to space restrictions. We would like to thank Xuemin Ma, Muhammad Anjam, and Vaughan Hurry for their constructive comments and suggestions on the manuscript.

Conflict of interest

The authors declare that the research was conducted in the absence of any commercial or financial relationships that could be construed as a potential conflict of interest.

The author(s) PM declared that they were an editorial board member of Frontiers, at the time of submission. This had no impact on the peer review process and the final decision.

Publisher's note

All claims expressed in this article are solely those of the authors and do not necessarily represent those of their affiliated organizations, or those of the publisher, the editors and the reviewers. Any product that may be evaluated in this article, or claim that may be made by its manufacturer, is not guaranteed or endorsed by the publisher.

Bai, L., Ma, X., Zhang, G., Song, S., Zhou, Y., Gao, L., et al. (2014). A receptor-like kinase mediates ammonium homeostasis and is important for the polar growth of root hairs in arabidopsis. Plant Cell 26, 1497–1511. doi: [10.1105/tpc.114.124586](https://doi.org/10.1105/tpc.114.124586)

Bai, L., Zhang, G., Zhou, Y., Zhang, Z., Wang, W., Du, Y., et al. (2009). Plasma membrane-associated proline-rich extensin-like receptor kinase 4, a novel regulator of Ca 2+ signalling, is required for abscisic acid responses in Arabidopsis thaliana. Plant J. 60, 314–327. doi: [10.1111/j.1365-313X.2009.03956.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-313X.2009.03956.x)

Barghahn, S., Arnal, G., Jain, N., Petutschnig, E., Brumer, H., and Lipka, V. (2021). Mixed Linkage β -1,3/1,4-Glucan Oligosaccharides Induce Defense Responses in Hordeum vulgare and Arabidopsis thaliana. Front. Plant Sci. 12. doi: [10.3389/](https://doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2021.682439) [fpls.2021.682439](https://doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2021.682439)

Basu, D., and Haswell, E. S. (2020). The mechanosensitive ion channel MSL10 potentiates responses to cell swelling in arabidopsis seedlings. Curr. Biol. 30, 2716– 2728.e6. doi: [10.1016/j.cub.2020.05.015](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2020.05.015)

Batistič, O., and Kudla, J. (2012). Analysis of calcium signaling pathways in plants. Biochim. Biophys. Acta (BBA) - Gen. Subj. 1820, 1283–1293. doi: [10.1016/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bbagen.2011.10.012) [j.bbagen.2011.10.012](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bbagen.2011.10.012)

Benedetti, M., Pontiggia, D., Raggi, S., Cheng, Z., Scaloni, F., Ferrari, S., et al. (2015). Plant immunity triggered by engineered in vivo release of oligogalacturonides, damage-associated molecular patterns. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.* 112, 5533–5538. doi: [10.1073/pnas.1504154112](https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1504154112)

Bhar, A., Chakraborty, A., and Roy, A. (2023). The captivating role of calcium in plant-microbe interaction. Front. Plant Sci. 14. doi: [10.3389/fpls.2023.1138252](https://doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2023.1138252)

Bidlack, J. (1992). Molecular structure and component integration of secondary cell walls in plants. 72, 51–56.

Blackburn, M. R., Haruta, M., and Moura, D. S. (2020). Twenty years of progress in physiological and biochemical investigation of RALF peptides. Plant Physiol. 182, 1657–1666. doi: [10.1104/pp.19.01310](https://doi.org/10.1104/pp.19.01310)

Boller, T., and Felix, G. (2009). A renaissance of elicitors: perception of microbeassociated molecular patterns and danger signals by pattern-recognition receptors. Annu. Rev. Plant Biol. 60, 379–406. doi: [10.1146/annurev.arplant.57.032905.105346](https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.arplant.57.032905.105346)

Boudsocq, M., and Sheen, J. (2013). CDPKs in immune and stress signaling. Trends Plant Sci. 18, 30–40. doi: [10.1016/j.tplants.2012.08.008](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tplants.2012.08.008)

Boudsocq, M., Willmann, M. R., McCormack, M., Lee, H., Shan, L., He, P., et al. (2010). Differential innate immune signalling via Ca2+ sensor protein kinases. Nature 464, 418–422. doi: [10.1038/nature08794](https://doi.org/10.1038/nature08794)

Brutus, A., Sicilia, F., Macone, A., Cervone, F., and De Lorenzo, G. (2010). A domain swap approach reveals a role of the plant wall-associated kinase 1 (WAK1) as a receptor of oligogalacturonides. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 107, 9452–9457. doi: [10.1073/](https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1000675107) [pnas.1000675107](https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1000675107)

Bush, D. S. (1995). Calcium regulation in plant cells and its role in signaling. Annu. Rev. Plant Physiol. Plant Mol. Biol. 46, 95–122.

Cao, Y., Liang, Y., Tanaka, K., Nguyen, C. T., Jedrzejczak, R. P., Joachimiak, A., et al. (2014). The kinase LYK5 is a major chitin receptor in Arabidopsis and forms a chitininduced complex with related kinase CERK1. eLife 3, e03766. doi: [10.7554/eLife.03766](https://doi.org/10.7554/eLife.03766)

Cassab, G. I. (1998). PLANT CELL WALL PROTEINS. Annu. Rev. Plant Physiol. Plant Mol. Biol. 49, 281–309. doi: [10.1146/annurev.arplant.49.1.281](https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.arplant.49.1.281)

Cheng, S.-H., Willmann, M. R., Chen, H.-C., and Sheen, J. (2002). Calcium signaling through protein kinases. The arabidopsis calcium-dependent protein kinase gene
family. *Plant Physiol*. 129, 469–485. doi: [10.1104/pp.005645](https://doi.org/10.1104/pp.005645)

Chinchilla, D., Zipfel, C., Robatzek, S., Kemmerling, B., Nürnberger, T., Jones, J. D. G., et al. (2007). A flagellin-induced complex of the receptor FLS2 and BAK1 initiates plant defence. Nature 448, 497–500. doi: [10.1038/nature05999](https://doi.org/10.1038/nature05999)

Chisholm, S. T., Coaker, G., Day, B., and Staskawicz, B. J. (2006). Host-microbe interactions: shaping the evolution of the plant immune response. Cell 124, 803–814. doi: [10.1016/j.cell.2006.02.008](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cell.2006.02.008)

Choi, W., Miller, G., Wallace, I., Harper, J., Mittler, R., and Gilroy, S. (2017). Orchestrating rapid long-distance signaling in plants with Ca²⁺, ROS and electrical signals. Plant J. 90, 698–707. doi: [10.1111/tpj.13492](https://doi.org/10.1111/tpj.13492)

Clapham, D. E. (2007). Calcium signaling. Cell 131, 1047–1058. doi: [10.1016/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cell.2007.11.028) [j.cell.2007.11.028](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cell.2007.11.028)

Cosgrove, D. J. (2005). Growth of the plant cell wall. Nat. Rev. Mol. Cell Biol. 6, 850– 861. doi: [10.1038/nrm1746](https://doi.org/10.1038/nrm1746)

Cosgrove, D. J., and Jarvis, M. C. (2012). Comparative structure and biomechanics of plant primary and secondary cell walls. Front. Plant Sci. 3. doi: [10.3389/fpls.2012.00204](https://doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2012.00204)

Danna, C. H., Zhang, X.-C., Khatri, A., Bent, A. F., Ronald, P. C., Ausubel, F. M., et al. (2012). FLS2-Mediated Responses to Ax21-Derived Peptides: Response to the Mueller Commentary. Plant Cell 24, 3174–3176. doi: [10.1105/tpc.112.099275](https://doi.org/10.1105/tpc.112.099275)

Decreux, A., and Messiaen, J. (2005). Wall-associated kinase WAK1 interacts with cell wall pectins in a calcium-induced conformation. Plant Cell Physiol. 46, 268–278. doi: [10.1093/pcp/pci026](https://doi.org/10.1093/pcp/pci026)

Decreux, A., Thomas, A., Spies, B., Brasseur, R., Cutsem, P., and Messiaen, J. (2006). In vitro characterization of the homogalacturonan-binding domain of the wallassociated kinase WAK1 using site-directed mutagenesis. Phytochemistry 67, 1068– 1079. doi: [10.1016/j.phytochem.2006.03.009](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.phytochem.2006.03.009)

DeFalco, T. A., and Zipfel, C. (2021). Molecular mechanisms of early plant patterntriggered immune signaling. Mol. Cell 81, 3449–3467. doi: [10.1016/j.molcel.2021.07.029](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.molcel.2021.07.029)

Delormel, T., and Boudsocq, M. (2019). Properties and functions of calciumdependent protein kinases and their relatives in Arabidopsis thaliana. New Phytol. 224, 585–604. doi: [10.1111/nph.16088](https://doi.org/10.1111/nph.16088)

Denness, L., McKenna, J. F., Segonzac, C., Wormit, A., Madhou, P., Bennett, M., et al. (2011). Cell wall damage-induced lignin biosynthesis is regulated by a reactive oxygen species- and jasmonic acid-dependent process in arabidopsis. Plant Physiol. 156, 1364– 1374. doi: [10.1104/pp.111.175737](https://doi.org/10.1104/pp.111.175737)

Duan, Q., Kita, D., Li, C., Cheung, A. Y., and Wu, H.-M. (2010). FERONIA receptorlike kinase regulates RHO GTPase signaling of root hair development. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 107, 17821–17826. doi: [10.1073/pnas.1005366107](https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1005366107)

Dubiella, U., Seybold, H., Durian, G., Komander, E., Lassig, R., Witte, C.-P., et al. (2013). Calcium-dependent protein kinase/NADPH oxidase activation circuit is required for rapid defense signal propagation. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 110, 8744–8749. doi: [10.1073/pnas.1221294110](https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1221294110)

Engelsdorf, T., Gigli-Bisceglia, N., Veerabagu, M., McKenna, J. F., Vaahtera, L., Augstein, F., et al. (2018). The plant cell wall integrity maintenance and immune signaling systems cooperate to control stress responses in Arabidopsis thaliana. Sci. Signal. 11, eaao3070. doi: [10.1126/scisignal.aao3070](https://doi.org/10.1126/scisignal.aao3070)

Engelsdorf, T., and Hamann, T. (2014). An update on receptor-like kinase involvement in the maintenance of plant cell wall integrity. Ann. Bot. 114, 1339– 1347. doi: [10.1093/aob/mcu043](https://doi.org/10.1093/aob/mcu043)

Engelsdorf, T., Will, C., Hofmann, J., Schmitt, C., Merritt, B. B., Rieger, L., et al. (2016). Cell wall composition and penetration resistance against the fungal pathogen Colletotrichum higginsianum are affected by impaired starch turnover in Arabidopsis mutants. Journal of Exp. Botany 68 (3), 701–713, erw434. doi: [10.1093/jxb/erw434](https://doi.org/10.1093/jxb/erw434)

Espinoza, C., Liang, Y., and Stacey, G. (2017). Chitin receptor CERK 1 links salt stress and chitin-triggered innate immunity in Arabidopsis. Plant J. 89, 984–995. doi: [10.1111/tpj.13437](https://doi.org/10.1111/tpj.13437)

Feng, W., Kita, D., Peaucelle, A., Cartwright, H. N., Doan, V., Duan, Q., et al. (2018). The FERONIA Receptor Kinase Maintains Cell-Wall Integrity during Salt Stress through Ca2+ Signaling. Curr. Biol. 28, 666–675.e5. doi: [10.1016/j.cub.2018.01.023](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2018.01.023)

Franck, C. M., Westermann, J., and Boisson-Dernier, A. (2018). Plant malectin-like receptor kinases: from cell wall integrity to immunity and beyond. Annu. Rev. Plant Biol. 69, 301–328. doi: [10.1146/annurev-arplant-042817-040557](https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-arplant-042817-040557)

Furuichi, T., Iida, H., Sokabe, M., and Tatsumi, H. (2012). Expression of Arabidopsis MCA1 enhanced mechanosensitive channel activity in the Xenopus laevis oocyte plasma membrane. Plant Signaling Behav. 7, 1022–1026. doi: [10.4161/psb.20783](https://doi.org/10.4161/psb.20783)

Gachomo, E. W., Jno Baptiste, L., Kefela, T., Saidel, W. M., and Kotchoni, S. O. (2014). The Arabidopsis CURVY1 (CVY1) gene encoding a novel receptor-like protein kinase regulates cell morphogenesis, flowering time and seed production. BMC Plant Biol. 14, 221. doi: [10.1186/s12870-014-0221-7](https://doi.org/10.1186/s12870-014-0221-7)

Gale, U., Kemat, A., and Krens, F. (2019). Effect of calcium (Ca2+) on pectin and pectin methyl esterases (PME) in normal and hyperhydric leaves of arabidopsis cultured in vitro.

Galindo-Trigo, S., Blanco-Touriñán, N., DeFalco, T. A., Wells, E. S., Gray, J. E., Zipfel, C., et al. (2020). Cr RLK 1L receptor-like kinases HERK 1 and ANJEA are female determinants of pollen tube reception. EMBO Rep. 21, e48466. doi: [10.15252/](https://doi.org/10.15252/embr.201948466) [embr.201948466](https://doi.org/10.15252/embr.201948466)

Galletti, R., Ferrari, S., and De Lorenzo, G. (2011). Arabidopsis MPK3 and MPK6 Play Different Roles in Basal and Oligogalacturonide- or Flagellin-Induced Resistance against Botrytis cinerea. Plant Physiol. 157, 804–814. doi: [10.1104/pp.111.174003](https://doi.org/10.1104/pp.111.174003)

García Bossi, J., Kumar, K., Barberini, M. L., Domínguez, G. D., Rondón Guerrero, Y. D. C., Marino-Buslje, C., et al. (2020). The role of P-type IIA and P-type IIB Ca2+-ATPases in plant development and growth. J. Exp. Bot. 71, 1239–1248. doi: [10.1093/jxb/erz521](https://doi.org/10.1093/jxb/erz521)

Geisler, M., Axelsen, K. B., Harper, J. F., and Palmgren, M. G. (2000). Molecular aspects of higher plant P-type Ca2+-ATPases. Biochim. Biophys. Acta (BBA) - Biomembranes 1465, 52–78. doi: [10.1016/S0005-2736\(00\)00131-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0005-2736(00)00131-0)

Gigli-Bisceglia, N., Engelsdorf, T., and Hamann, T. (2020). Plant cell wall integrity maintenance in model plants and crop species-relevant cell wall components and underlying guiding principles. Cell. Mol. Life Sci. 77, 2049–2077. doi: [10.1007/s00018-](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00018-019-03388-8) [019-03388-8](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00018-019-03388-8)

Gigli-Bisceglia, N., van Zelm, E., Huo, W., Lamers, J., and Testerink, C. (2022). Arabidopsis root responses to salinity depend on pectin modification and cell wall sensing. Development 149, dev200363. doi: [10.1242/dev.200363](https://doi.org/10.1242/dev.200363)

Glazebrook, J. (2005). Contrasting mechanisms of defense against biotrophic and necrotrophic pathogens. Annu. Rev. Phytopathol. 43, 205–227. doi: [10.1146/](https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.phyto.43.040204.135923) [annurev.phyto.43.040204.135923](https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.phyto.43.040204.135923)

Gonneau, M., Desprez, T., Martin, M., Doblas, V. G., Bacete, L., Miart, F., et al. (2018). Receptor kinase THESEUS1 is a rapid alkalinization factor 34 receptor in arabidopsis. Curr. Biol. 28, 2452–2458.e4. doi: [10.1016/j.cub.2018.05.075](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2018.05.075)

Gómez-Gómez, and Boller. (2000). P. O. FLS2: an LRR receptor–like kinase involved in the perception of the bacterial elicitor flagellin in arabidopsis. Mol. Cell.

Gravino, M., Savatin, D. V., Macone, A., and De Lorenzo, G. (2015). Ethylene production in B otrytis cinerea- and oligogalacturonide-induced immunity requires calcium-dependent protein kinases. Plant J. 84, 1073–1086. doi: [10.1111/tpj.13057](https://doi.org/10.1111/tpj.13057)

Harmon, A. C., Yoo, B.-C., and McCaffery, C. (1994). Pseudosubstrate inhibition of CDPK, a protein kinase with a calmodulin-like domain. Biochemistry 33, 7278–7287. doi: [10.1021/bi00189a032](https://doi.org/10.1021/bi00189a032)

Harper, J. F., Huang, J.-F., and Lloyd, S. J. (1994). Genetic identification of an autoinhibitor in CDPK, a protein kinase with a calmodulin-like domain. Biochemistry 33, 7267–7277. doi: [10.1021/bi00189a031](https://doi.org/10.1021/bi00189a031)

Haruta, M., Sabat, G., Stecker, K., Minkoff, B. B., and Sussman, M. R. (2014). A peptide hormone and its receptor protein kinase regulate plant cell expansion. Science 343, 408–411. doi: [10.1126/science.1244454](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1244454)

Heese, A., Hann, D. R., Gimenez-Ibanez, S., Jones, A. M. E., He, K., Li, J., et al. (2007). The receptor-like kinase SERK3/BAK1 is a central regulator of innate immunity in plants. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 104, 12217–12222. doi: [10.1073/pnas.0705306104](https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0705306104)

Hématy, K., Sado, P.-E., Van Tuinen, A., Rochange, S., Desnos, T., Balzergue, S., et al. (2007). A receptor-like kinase mediates the response of arabidopsis cells to the inhibition of cellulose synthesis. Curr. Biol. 17, 922–931. doi: [10.1016/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2007.05.018) [j.cub.2007.05.018](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2007.05.018)

Hepler, P. K., and Winship, L. J. (2010). Calcium at the cell wall-cytoplast interface. J. Integr. Plant Biol. 52, 147–160. doi: [10.1111/j.1744-7909.2010.00923.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1744-7909.2010.00923.x)

Huffaker, A., Pearce, G., and Ryan, C. A. (2006). An endogenous peptide signal in Arabidopsis activates components of the innate immune response. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 103, 10098–10103. doi: [10.1073/pnas.0603727103](https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0603727103)

Hurni, S., Scheuermann, D., Krattinger, S. G., Kessel, B., Wicker, T., Herren, G., et al. (2015). The maize disease resistance gene Htn1 against northern corn leaf blight encodes a wall-associated receptor-like kinase. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 112, 8780– 8785. doi: [10.1073/pnas.1502522112](https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1502522112)

Jarvis, M. C. (1982). The proportion of calcium-bound pectin in plant cell walls. Planta 154, 344–346. doi: [10.1007/BF00393913](https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00393913)

Jones, J. D. G., and Dangl, J. L. (2006). The plant immune system. Nature 444, 323– 329. doi: [10.1038/nature05286](https://doi.org/10.1038/nature05286)

Kaku, H., Nishizawa, Y., Ishii-Minami, N., Akimoto-Tomiyama, C., Dohmae, N., Takio, K., et al. (2006). Plant cells recognize chitin fragments for defense signaling through a plasma membrane receptor. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 103, 11086–11091. doi: [10.1073/pnas.0508882103](https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0508882103)

Keinath, N. F., Waadt, R., Brugman, R., Schroeder, J. I., Grossmann, G., Schumacher, K., et al. (2015). Live Cell Imaging with R-GECO1 Sheds Light on flg22- and Chitin-Induced Transient [Ca 2+] cyt Patterns in Arabidopsis. Mol. Plant 8, 1188–1200. doi: [10.1016/j.molp.2015.05.006](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.molp.2015.05.006)

Keller, B. (1993). Structural cell wall proteins. Plant Physiol. 101, 1127–1130. doi: [10.1104/pp.101.4.1127](https://doi.org/10.1104/pp.101.4.1127)

Knight, H. (1996). Cold Calcium Signaling in Arabidopsis lnvolves Two Cellular Pools and a Change in Calcium Signature after Acclimation. The Plant Cell. 8, 489–503.

Kobayashi, M., Ohura, I., Kawakita, K., Yokota, N., Fujiwara, M., Shimamoto, K., et al. (2007). Calcium-dependent protein kinases regulate the production of reactive oxygen species by potato NADPH oxidase. Plant Cell 19, 1065–1080. doi: [10.1105/](https://doi.org/10.1105/tpc.106.048884) [tpc.106.048884](https://doi.org/10.1105/tpc.106.048884)

Kobayashi, M., Yoshioka, M., Asai, S., Nomura, H., Kuchimura, K., Mori, H., et al. (2012). StCDPK5 confers resistance to late blight pathogen but increases susceptibility to early blight pathogen in potato via reactive oxygen species burst. New Phytol. 196, 223–237. doi: [10.1111/j.1469-8137.2012.04226.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8137.2012.04226.x)

Kohler, C., Merkle, T., and Neuhaus, G. (1999). Characterisation of a novel gene family of putative cyclic nucleotide- and calmodulin-regulated ion channels in Arabidopsis thaliana. Plant J. 18, 97–104. doi: [10.1046/j.1365-313X.1999.00422.x](https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-313X.1999.00422.x)

Kohorn, B. D., and Kohorn, S. L. (2012). The cell wall-associated kinases, WAKs, as pectin receptors. Front. Plant Sci. 3. doi: [10.3389/fpls.2012.00088](https://doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2012.00088)

Köster, P., DeFalco, T. A., and Zipfel, C. (2022). Ca²⁺ signals in plant immunity. EMBO J. 41, e110741. doi: [10.15252/embj.2022110741](https://doi.org/10.15252/embj.2022110741)

Krol, E., Mentzel, T., Chinchilla, D., Boller, T., Felix, G., Kemmerling, B., et al. (2010). Perception of the arabidopsis danger signal peptide 1 involves the pattern recognition receptor atPEPR1 and its close homologue atPEPR2. J. Biol. Chem. 285, 13471–13479. doi: [10.1074/jbc.M109.097394](https://doi.org/10.1074/jbc.M109.097394)

Lam, H.-M., Chiu, J., Hsieh, M.-H., Meisel, L., Oliveira, I. C., Shin, M., et al. (1998). Glutamate-receptor genes in plants. Nature 396, 125–126. doi: [10.1038/24066](https://doi.org/10.1038/24066)

Larrainzar, E., Wienkoop, S., Weckwerth, W., Ladrera, R., Arrese-Igor, C., and
González, E. M. (2007). *Medicago truncatula* root nodule proteome analysis reveals differential plant and bacteroid responses to drought stress. Plant Physiol. 144, 1495– 1507. doi: [10.1104/pp.107.101618](https://doi.org/10.1104/pp.107.101618)

Li, C., Wu, H.-M., and Cheung, A. Y. (2016). FERONIA and her pals: functions and mechanisms. Plant Physiol. 171, 2379–2392. doi: [10.1104/pp.16.00667](https://doi.org/10.1104/pp.16.00667)

Li, H., Zhou, S.-Y., Zhao, W.-S., Su, S.-C., and Peng, Y.-L. (2009). A novel wallassociated receptor-like protein kinase gene, OsWAK1, plays important roles in rice blast disease resistance. Plant Mol. Biol. 69, 337–346. doi: [10.1007/s11103-008-9430-5](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11103-008-9430-5)

Liang, X., and Zhou, J.-M. (2018). Receptor-like cytoplasmic kinases: central players in plant receptor kinase–mediated signaling. Annu. Rev. Plant Biol. 69, 267–299. doi: [10.1146/annurev-arplant-042817-040540](https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-arplant-042817-040540)

Lindner, H., Müller, L. M., Boisson-Dernier, A., and Grossniklaus, U. (2012). CrRLK1L receptor-like kinases: not just another brick in the wall. Curr. Opin. Plant Biol. 15, 659–669. doi: [10.1016/j.pbi.2012.07.003](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pbi.2012.07.003)

Liu, T., Liu, Z., Song, C., Hu, Y., Han, Z., She, J., et al. (2012). Chitin-induced dimerization activates a plant immune receptor. Science 336, 1160–1164. doi: [10.1126/](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1218867) [science.1218867](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1218867)

Lu, D., Wu, S., He, P., and Shan, L. (2010). Phosphorylation of receptor-like cytoplasmic kinases by bacterial Flagellin. Plant Signaling Behav. 5, 598–600. doi: [10.4161/psb.11500](https://doi.org/10.4161/psb.11500)

Luan, S. (2009). The CBL–CIPK network in plant calcium signaling. Trends Plant Sci. 14, 37–42. doi: [10.1016/j.tplants.2008.10.005](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tplants.2008.10.005)

Ma, Y., Walker, R. K., Zhao, Y., and Berkowitz, G. A. (2012). Linking ligand perception by PEPR pattern recognition receptors to cytosolic Ca 2+ elevation and downstream immune signaling in plants. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 109, 19852-19857. doi: [10.1073/pnas.1205448109](https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1205448109)

Martín-Dacal, M., Fernández-Calvo, P., Jiménez-Sandoval, P., López, G., Garrido-Arandía, M., Rebaque, D., et al. (2023). Arabidopsis immune responses triggered by cellulose- and mixed-linked glucan-derived oligosaccharides require a group of LEUCINE-RICH REPEAT MALECTIN receptor kinases. Plant J. 113, 833-850. doi: [10.1111/](https://doi.org/10.1111/tpj.16088) [tpj.16088](https://doi.org/10.1111/tpj.16088)

Martín-Dacal, M., Fernández-Calvo, P., Jiménez-Sandoval, P., López, G., Garrido-Arandıa, M., Rebaque, D., et al. (2022). Arabidopsis Leucine Rich Repeat-Malectin ́ Receptor Kinases in immunity triggered by cellulose and mixed-linked glucan oligosaccharides (preprint). Plant Biol. doi: [10.1101/2022.08.09.503277](https://doi.org/10.1101/2022.08.09.503277)

Martín-Dacal, M., Fernández-Calvo, P., Jiménez-Sandoval, P., López, G., Garrido-Arandıa, M., Rebaque, D., et al. (2022). Arabidopsis Leucine Rich Repeat-Malectin ́ Receptor Kinases in immunity triggered by cellulose and mixed-linked glucan oligosaccharides (preprint). Plant Biol. doi: [10.1101/2022.08.09.503277](https://doi.org/10.1101/2022.08.09.503277)

Mélida, H., Sopeña-Torres, S., Bacete, L., Garrido-Arandia, M., Jordá, L., López, G., et al. (2018). Non-branched β-1,3-glucan oligosaccharides trigger immune responses in Arabidopsis. Plant J. 93, 34–49. doi: [10.1111/tpj.13755](https://doi.org/10.1111/tpj.13755)

Miedes, E., Vanholme, R., Boerjan, W., and Molina, A. (2014). The role of the secondary cell wall in plant resistance to pathogens. Front. Plant Sci. 5. doi: [10.3389/fpls.2014.00358](https://doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2014.00358)

Miya, A., Albert, P., Shinya, T., Desaki, Y., Ichimura, K., Shirasu, K., et al. (2007). CERK1, a LysM receptor kinase, is essential for chitin elicitor signaling in Arabidopsis. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 104, 19613–19618. doi: [10.1073/pnas.0705147104](https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0705147104)

Nissen, K. S., Willats, W. G. T., and Malinovsky, F. G. (2016). Understanding crRLK1L function: cell walls and growth control. Trends Plant Sci. 21, 516–527. doi: [10.1016/j.tplants.2015.12.004](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tplants.2015.12.004)

Petutschnig, E. K., Jones, A. M. E., Serazetdinova, L., Lipka, U., and Lipka, V. (2010). The lysin motif receptor-like kinase (LysM-RLK) CERK1 is a major chitin-binding protein in arabidopsis thaliana and subject to chitin-induced phosphorylation. J. Biol. Chem. 285, 28902–28911. doi: [10.1074/jbc.M110.116657](https://doi.org/10.1074/jbc.M110.116657)

Qu, S., Zhang, X., Song, Y., Lin, J., and Shan, X. (2017). THESEUS1 positively modulates plant defense responses against Botrytis cinerea through GUANINE EXCHANGE FACTOR4 signaling: THE1 functions in plant defense responses. J. Integr. Plant Biol. 59, 797–804. doi: [10.1111/jipb.12565](https://doi.org/10.1111/jipb.12565)

Ranty, B., Aldon, D., Cotelle, V., Galaud, J.-P., Thuleau, P., and Mazars, C. (2016). Calcium sensors as key hubs in plant responses to biotic and abiotic stresses. Front. Plant Sci 7, 327. doi: [10.3389/fpls.2016.00327](https://doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2016.00327)

Rebaque, D., Del Hierro, I., López, G., Bacete, L., Vilaplana, F., Dallabernardina, P., et al. (2021). Cell wall-derived mixed-linked β -1,3/1,4-glucans trigger immune responses and disease resistance in plants. Plant J. 106, 601–615. doi: [10.1111/tpj.15185](https://doi.org/10.1111/tpj.15185)

Roux, M., Schwessinger, B., Albrecht, C., Chinchilla, D., Jones, A., Holton, N., et al. (2011). The arabidopsis leucine-rich repeat receptor–like kinases BAK1/SERK3 and BKK1/SERK4 are required for innate immunity to hemibiotrophic and biotrophic pathogens. Plant Cell 23, 2440–2455. doi: [10.1105/tpc.111.084301](https://doi.org/10.1105/tpc.111.084301)

Schoenaers, S., Balcerowicz, D., Costa, A., and Vissenberg, K. (2017). The kinase ERULUS controls pollen tube targeting and growth in arabidopsis thaliana. Front. Plant Sci. 8. doi: [10.3389/fpls.2017.01942](https://doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2017.01942)

Schulz, P., Herde, M., and Romeis, T. (2013). Calcium-dependent protein kinases: hubs in plant stress signaling and development. Plant Physiol. 163, 523–530. doi: [10.1104/pp.113.222539](https://doi.org/10.1104/pp.113.222539)

Shimizu, T., Nakano, T., Takamizawa, D., Desaki, Y., Ishii-Minami, N., Nishizawa, Y., et al. (2010). Two LysM receptor molecules, CEBiP and OsCERK1, cooperatively regulate chitin elicitor signaling in rice: LysM receptors for rice chitin signaling. Plant J. 64, 204–214. doi: [10.1111/j.1365-313X.2010.04324.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-313X.2010.04324.x)

Seybold, H., Trempel, F., Ranf, S., Scheel, D., Romeis, T., and Lee, J. (2014). Ca^{2+} signalling in plant immune response: from pattern recognition receptors to Ca^{2+} decoding mechanisms. New Phytol. 204, 782–790. doi: [10.1111/nph.13031](https://doi.org/10.1111/nph.13031)

Shigaki, T., and Hirschi, K. (2000). Characterization of CAX-like genes in plants: implications for functional diversity. Gene 257, 291–298. doi: [10.1016/S0378-1119\(00\)](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0378-1119(00)00390-5) [00390-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0378-1119(00)00390-5)

Shinya, T., Yamaguchi, K., Desaki, Y., Yamada, K., Narisawa, T., Kobayashi, Y., et al. (2014). Selective regulation of the chitin-induced defense response by the Arabidopsis receptor-like cytoplasmic kinase PBL27. Plant J. 79, 56–66. doi: [10.1111/](https://doi.org/10.1111/tpj.12535) [tpj.12535](https://doi.org/10.1111/tpj.12535)

Smakowska-Luzan, E., Mott, G. A., Parys, K., Stegmann, M., Howton, T. C., Layeghifard, M., et al. (2018). An extracellular network of Arabidopsis leucine-rich repeat receptor kinases. Nature 553, 342–346. doi: [10.1038/nature25184](https://doi.org/10.1038/nature25184)

Snedden, W. A., and Fromm, H. (2001). Calmodulin as a versatile calcium signal transducer in plants. New Phytol. 151, 35–66. doi: [10.1046/j.1469-8137.2001.](https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1469-8137.2001.00154.x) [00154.x](https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1469-8137.2001.00154.x)

Solis-Miranda, J., and Quinto, C. (2021). The CrRLK1L subfamily: One of the keys to versatility in plants. Plant Physiol. Biochem. 166, 88–102. doi: [10.1016/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.plaphy.2021.05.028) [j.plaphy.2021.05.028](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.plaphy.2021.05.028)

Souza, C., de, A., Li, S., Lin, A. Z., Boutrot, F., Grossmann, G., et al. (2017). Cellulosederived oligomers act as damage-associated molecular patterns and trigger defense-like responses. Plant Physiol. 173, 2383–2398. doi: [10.1104/pp.16.01680](https://doi.org/10.1104/pp.16.01680)

Souza, C. D. A., Li, S., Lin, A. Z., Boutrot, F., Grossmann, G., Zipfel, C., et al. (2017). Cellulose-derived oligomers act as damage-associated molecular patterns and trigger defense-like responses. Plant Physiol. 173, 2383–2398. doi: [10.1104/pp.16.01680](https://doi.org/10.1104/pp.16.01680)

Stegmann, M., Monaghan, J., Smakowska-Luzan, E., Rovenich, H., Lehner, A., Holton, N., et al. (2017). The receptor kinase FER is a RALF-regulated scaffold controlling plant immune signaling. Science 355, 287–289. doi: [10.1126/science.aal2541](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aal2541)

Thor, K. (2019). Calcium—Nutrient and messenger. Front. Plant Sci. 10. doi: [10.3389/fpls.2019.00440](https://doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2019.00440)

Tian, W., Hou, C., Ren, Z., Wang, C., Zhao, F., Dahlbeck, D., et al. (2019). A calmodulin-gated calcium channel links pathogen patterns to plant immunity. Nature 572, 131–135. doi: [10.1038/s41586-019-1413-y](https://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-019-1413-y)

Tripathi, R. K., Aguirre, J. A., and Singh, J. (2021). Genome-wide analysis of wall associated kinase (WAK) gene family in barley. Genomics 113, 523–530. doi: [10.1016/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ygeno.2020.09.045) [j.ygeno.2020.09.045](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ygeno.2020.09.045)

Tseng, Y.-H., Scholz, S. S., Fliegmann, J., Krüger, T., Gandhi, A., Furch, A. C. U., et al. (2022). CORK1 is required for cellooligomer-induced responses in arabidopsis thaliana. Cells 11, 2960. doi: [10.3390/cells11192960](https://doi.org/10.3390/cells11192960)

Vaahtera, L., Schulz, J., and Hamann, T. (2019). Cell wall integrity maintenance during plant development and interaction with the environment. Nat. Plants 5, 924-932. doi: [10.1038/s41477-019-0502-0](https://doi.org/10.1038/s41477-019-0502-0)

Vallarino, J. G., and Osorio, S. (2012). Signaling role of oligogalacturonides derived during cell wall degradation. Plant Signaling Behav. 7, 1447–1449. doi: [10.4161/](https://doi.org/10.4161/psb.21779) [psb.21779](https://doi.org/10.4161/psb.21779)

van den Brink, J., and de Vries, R. P. (2011). Fungal enzyme sets for plant polysaccharide degradation. Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 91, 1477–1492. doi: [10.1007/](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00253-011-3473-2) $\frac{1}{5}00253-011-3473-2$

Van Der Does, D., Boutrot, F., Engelsdorf, T., Rhodes, J., McKenna, J. F., Vernhettes, S., et al. (2017). The Arabidopsis leucine-rich repeat receptor kinase MIK2/LRR-KISS connects cell wall integrity sensing, root growth and response to abiotic and biotic stresses. PloS Genet. 13, e1006832. doi: [10.1371/journal.pgen.](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pgen.1006832) [1006832](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pgen.1006832)

Verica, J. A., Chae, L., Tong, H., Ingmire, P., and He, Z.-H. (2003). Tissue-specific and developmentally regulated expression of a cluster of tandemly arrayed cell wallassociated kinase-like kinase genes in arabidopsis. Plant Physiol. 133, 1732–1746. doi: [10.1104/pp.103.028530](https://doi.org/10.1104/pp.103.028530)

Verica, J. A., and He, Z.-H. (2002). The cell wall-associated kinase (WAK) and WAK -like kinase gene family. Plant Physiol. 129, 455–459. doi: [10.1104/pp.011028](https://doi.org/10.1104/pp.011028)

Wan, J., He, M., Hou, Q., Zou, L., Yang, Y., Wei, Y., et al. (2021). Cell wall associated immunity in plants. Stress Biol. 1, 3. doi: [10.1007/s44154-021-00003-4](https://doi.org/10.1007/s44154-021-00003-4)

Wolf, S. (2017). Plant cell wall signalling and receptor-like kinases. Biochem. J. 474, 471–492. doi: [10.1042/BCJ20160238](https://doi.org/10.1042/BCJ20160238)

Wu, H.-C., Bulgakov, V. P., and Jinn, T.-L. (2018). Pectin methylesterases: cell wall remodeling proteins are required for plant response to heat stress. Front. Plant Sci. 9. doi: [10.3389/fpls.2018.01612](https://doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2018.01612)

Wudick, M. M., Michard, E., Oliveira Nunes, C., and Feijó, J. A. (2018). Comparing plant and animal glutamate receptors: common traits but different fates? J. Exp. Bot. 69, 4151–4163. doi: [10.1093/jxb/ery153](https://doi.org/10.1093/jxb/ery153)

Xie, F., Murray, J. D., Kim, J., Heckmann, A. B., Edwards, A., Oldroyd, G. E. D., et al. (2012). Legume pectate lyase required for root infection by rhizobia. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 109, 633–638. doi: [10.1073/pnas.1113992109](https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1113992109)

Yamaguchi, Y., Huffaker, A., Bryan, A. C., Tax, F. E., and Ryan, C. A. (2010). PEPR2 is a second receptor for the pep1 and pep2 peptides and contributes to defense responses in arabidopsis. Plant Cell 22, 508–522. doi: [10.1105/tpc.109.068874](https://doi.org/10.1105/tpc.109.068874)

Yang, T., and Poovaiah, B. W. (2003). Calcium/calmodulin-mediated signal network in plants. Trends Plant Sci. 8, 505–512. doi: [10.1016/j.tplants.2003.09.004](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tplants.2003.09.004)

Yoo, B.-C., and Harmon, A. C. (1996). Intramolecular binding contributes to the activation of CDPK, a protein kinase with a calmodulin-like domain. Biochemistry 35, 12029–12037. doi: [10.1021/bi9606612](https://doi.org/10.1021/bi9606612)

Yu, X., Feng, B., He, P., and Shan, L. (2017). From chaos to harmony: responses and signaling upon microbial pattern recognition. Annu. Rev. Phytopathol. 55, 109–137. doi: [10.1146/annurev-phyto-080516-035649](https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-phyto-080516-035649)

Yuan, P., Jauregui, E., Du, L., Tanaka, K., and Poovaiah, B. (2017). Calcium signatures and signaling events orchestrate plant–microbe interactions. Curr. Opin. Plant Biol. 38, 173–183. doi: [10.1016/j.pbi.2017.06.003](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pbi.2017.06.003)

Yuan, F., Yang, H., Xue, Y., Kong, D., Ye, R., Li, C., et al. (2014). OSCA1 mediates osmotic-stress-evoked Ca2+ increases vital for osmosensing in Arabidopsis. Nature 514, 367–371. doi: [10.1038/nature13593](https://doi.org/10.1038/nature13593)

Zhou, J.-M., and Zhang, Y. (2020). Plant immunity: danger perception and signaling. Cell 181, 978–989. doi: [10.1016/j.cell.2020.04.028](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cell.2020.04.028)

Zipfel, C. (2014). Plant pattern-recognition receptors. Trends Immunol. 35, 345–351. doi: [10.1016/j.it.2014.05.004](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.it.2014.05.004)

Zuo, W., Chao, Q., Zhang, N., Ye, J., Tan, G., Li, B., et al. (2015). A maize wall-associated kinase confers quantitative resistance to head smut. Nat. Genet. 47, 151-157. doi: [10.1038/ng.3170](https://doi.org/10.1038/ng.3170)